Marcin Sumowski (Toruń)


The battle of Grunwald/Tannenberg between the Polish-Lithuanian army and the military forces of the Teutonic Order on 15 July 1410 is one of the most important events in the history of Central Europe in the late Middle Ages. It comes as no surprise that this issue has been analysed and reanalysed by subsequent generations of historians. However, in the 19th century and in the first decades of the 20th century the subject was dealt with almost exclusively by German and Polish historians. It was not until after the Second World War that the Grunwald question gradually developed both in terms of research methodology and the number of academics of different nationalities interested in the issue. As French researchers have not shown much interest in the battle of Grunwald so far, the appearance of a new French monograph devoted to it should be welcomed. Its author Sylvain Gouguenheim, a professor at the École Normale Supérieure in Lyon, is an outstanding expert in the history of the later Middle Ages.

At the beginning of his book Gouguenheim explains that he decided to use the German terminology for the location of the medieval battle, Tannenberg, as it is frequently used in Western European historiography, although he is aware of the origins of its propagandistic use by the Germans after World War One. In discussing the controversies connected with the actual site of the battle, he concludes that the decisive fights took place probably in the vicinity of the village of Grunwald, whose name should be employed in historiography.

In Chapter I (“War”) Gouguenheim discussess the population and geopolitical situation of the warring parties, the direct and indirect causes of the war, the first stage of the conflict between 16 August and 8 October 1409 and the preparations for the decisive stage of the conflict along with the events taking place at the beginning of July 1410. The chapter concludes with a discussion of the most important written and archaeological sources which form the basis for research on the battle, emphasizing some of the difficulties and limitations connected with the interpretation of the sources. Chapter II (“Those who fought and those who stayed in the shadow”) first discusses the numerical strength of both armies, their individual units, recruitment practices, the issues of using regular military units,
weaponry (including artillery), the structure of banners and their practical use in the battle. The second part of this chapter presents behind-the-scenes activity such as intelligence services, espionage, and disinformation, maintaining that their skilful use could have contributed to the victory of the Polish-Lithuanian armies. In Chapter III (“A long march”) Gouguenheim draws on his own analysis of the sources, in contrast to the views of other researchers, to reconstruct the routes used by both armies to change positions between 3 and 15 July 1410. He devotes close attention to the conquest of Dąbrówno [Gilgenburg] (13 July) by the Polish-Lithuanian military forces as well as to the controversial issue of both armies’ approaching the site of the battle on 14–15 July. In his opinion, the question still remains open, although he considers the suggestions of Sven Ekdahl and Krzysztof Kwiatkowski to be the most probable. The reconstruction of each army’s march and the most probable directions from which they approached Grunwald are illustrated maps included on pages 82–83 and 102–103.

Chapter IV (“Before the battle”) describes the events of 15 July from the early morning to the beginning of the battle at noon. Particular attention is devoted to the locations of individual military units, the reasons why King Władysław Jagiełło delayed the order to start the battle, and the question of the Teutonic Order’s attempt to convince the Polish monarch to start the battle with the swords delivered to him by heralds. Chapter V (“Magna Strages”) constitutes an in-depth discussion of the battle, in which the author tries to reconstruct the stages of the battle and their location by analysing the sources and critically approaching the assumptions made by other researchers. He also examines the possible losses in men suffered by both sides of the battle, concluding that in total about 8000 people were killed. However, it was not possible to establish which party suffered greater losses.

Chapter VI (“The right of the winners”) presents the direct effects of the victory of the Polish-Lithuanian army as well as further military activity up to the Peace of Toruń signed on 1 February 1411. Chapter VII (“Creating memory”) addresses the problem of the post-Grunwald propaganda war fought mostly in the first half of the 15th century, discussing the repercussions of the battle in Western Europe, mutual accusations and the participation of pagans and schismatics in the battle, as well as the more important polemical texts referring to the battle which were disseminated over Europe by both sides in the conflict. The final part of the chapter deals with the Grunwald tradition (or its deliberate concealment) in the context of the complicated Polish-German relations up to the 20th century. The conclusion of the book highlights some basic factors which contributed to the victory of the Polish-Lithuanian army as well as the short-term and long-term results of the battle. Gouguenheim’s book deserves praise. He has carried out an
independent analysis of the most important written sources from the period and shows an extraordinary knowledge of the literature available on the subject matter, taking into consideration all the most important and most recent scientific studies published in German, Polish and English. To sum up, Gouguenheim’s monograph may be regarded as one of the best books about the battle of Grunwald in historiography to date.

Sławomir Jóźwiak (Toruń)


The publication is the result of many years’ research by both authors on the castles of the commanders of the Teutonic Order. Some results of this have already been made available in journals („Komunikaty Mazursko-Warmińskie”, 2011, nr 2; „Kwartalnik Historii Kultury Materialnej”, t. 57, 2009, nr 3–4; „Zapiski Historyczne”, t. 72, 2007) as well as the monograph reissued two years ago which concerns the organization of life in Malbork castle in the times of grand masters (Organizacja życia na zamku krzyżackim w Malborku w czasach wielkich mistrzów (1309–1457), wyd. 2, Malbork 2011). The book discussed here is a continuation of this research, which presents findings based on source materials which had hitherto not been used. It is a particularly important stage in the research on the spatial development and the nomenclature of commanders’ castles in Prussia.

The authors survey the current state of the research on the subject in a critical and in-depth manner. In the introduction (pp. 7–18) they stress that the subject has so far been treated by art historians and archaeologists, which resulted in repeating the erroneous and obsolete statements of 19th-century German historiography. The main criticism made by the authors is the inadequate use of written sources, which are the only ones which reflect the context and understanding of individual space in castles by contemporary people. Manuscripts together with architectural analyses allow us to carry out a complete criticism of the material. Thus, the authors have included in their work a study of number of manuscripts, for example materials from the grand masters’ chancery from Malbork (Geheimes Staatsarchiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz in Berlin), documents issued by the Order’s authorities now in the Central Archive of the Teutonic Order in Vienna and doc-