

ORDINES MILITARES
COLLOQUIA TORUNENSIA HISTORICA
Yearbook for the Study of the Military Orders

vol. XVII (2012)



Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

EDITORIAL BOARD

Roman Czaja, Editor in Chief, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń
Jürgen Sarnowsky, Editor in Chief, University of Hamburg

Jochen Burgtorf, California State University
Sylvain Gouguenheim, École Normale Supérieure Lettres et Sciences Humaines de Lyon
Hubert Houben, Università del Salento Lecce
Alan V. Murray, University of Leeds
Krzysztof Kwiatkowski, Assistant Editor, Nicolaus Copernicus University Toruń

REVIEWERS:

Darius von Guettner, School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, University of Melbourne
Sławomir Józwiak, Institute of History and Archival Sciences, Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń
Tomasz Jurek, Institute of History of Polish Academy of Sciences
Juhan Kreem, City Archives of Tallinn
Johannes A. Mol, Institute for History, University Leiden
Maria Starnawska, Institute of History, Jan Długosz University in Częstochowa
Sławomir Zonnenberg, Institute of History and International Relationships, Kazimierz Wielki University in Bydgoszcz

ADDRESS OF EDITORIAL OFFICE:

Instytut Historii i Archiwistyki UMK, ul. Gagarina 9
87-100 Toruń
e-mail: rc@umk.pl
juergen.sarnowsky@uni-hamburg.de

Subscriptions orders should be addressed to:
books@umk.pl

Printed in Poland

© Copyright by Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika
© Copyright by Towarzystwo Naukowe w Toruniu
Toruń 2012

ISSN 0867-2008

NICOLAUS COPERNICUS UNIVERSITY PRESS

EDITORIAL OFFICE: ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

tel. (0) 56 611 42 95, fax (0) 56 611 47 05

e-mail: wydawnictwo@umk.pl

DISTRIBUTION: ul. Reja 25, 87-100 Toruń

tel./fax (0) 56 611 42 38

e-mail: books@umk.pl

www.wydawnictwoumk.pl

First edition

Print: Nicolaus Copernicus University Press
ul. Gagarina 5, 87-100 Toruń

CONTENTS

I. STUDIES AND ARTICLES FROM THE 16TH ORDINES MILITARES CONFERENCE

<i>Philippe Josserand</i> (Nantes) Grenze(n) und geistliche Ritterorden in der lateinischen Welt des Mittelalters	7
<i>Damien Carraz</i> (Clermont-Ferrand) <i>Sub eiusdem pacis et treugue Dei defensione</i> . Die Ritterorden und der Frieden in Südfrankreich im 12. Jahrhundert	17
<i>Alan Forey</i> (Kirtlington) The Participation of the Military Orders in Truces with Muslims in the Holy Land and Spain during the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries	41
<i>Shlomo Lotan</i> (Ramat-Gan) The Battle of La Forbie (1244) and its Aftermath – Re-examination of the Military Orders’ Involvement in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem in the mid-Thirteenth Century	53
<i>Jürgen Sarnowsky</i> (Hamburg) Die Ritterorden und der Krieg von St. Sabas	69
<i>Pierre Bonneaud</i> (Uzès) Negotiation and warfare: The Hospitallers of Rhodes around and after the Fall of Constantinople (1426–1480)	81
<i>Helen J. Nicholson</i> (Cardiff) The Hospitallers’ and Templars’ involvement in warfare on the frontiers of the British Isles in the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries	105

II. OTHER STUDIES

- László Pószán* (Debrecen)
Der Deutsche Orden im mittelalterlichen Ungarn 123
- Christian Vogel* (Saarbrücken)
Meisterwahlen in den mittelalterlichen Ritterorden – Johanniter, Templer
und Deutscher Orden im Vergleich 137

III. MISCELLANEOUS AND OTHER MATERIALS

- Paweł A. Jeziorski* (Toruń)
Das Verzeichnis der von Hochmeister Ludwig von Erlichshausen
Begnadigten. Eine Quelle zur Geschichte der hochmeisterlichen
Landrundreise in den Jahren 1450–1451 157

IV. BOOK REVIEWS AND BOOK NOTICES

- Documents Concerning Cyprus from the Hospital's Rhodian Archives: 1409–1459*,
ed. Karl Borchardt, Anthony Luttrell, Ekhard Schöffler (*Jürgen Sarnowsky*) 203
- Zsolt Hunyadi, *The Hospitallers in the Medieval Kingdom of Hungary c. 1150–
–1387* (*Gábor Bradács*) 204
- Bernhart Jähmig, Verfassung und Verwaltung des Deutschen Ordens und seiner
Herrschaft in Livland (*Piotr Oliński*) 206
- Máté Molnár, *A templomos lovagrend alkonya* (*Ádám Debreczeni*) 208
- Nicholas Edward Morton, *The Teutonic Knights in the Holy Land 1190–1291*
(*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 211
- Anat Peled, *Sugar in the Kingdom of Jerusalem. A Crusader Technology between
East and West* (*Shlomo Lotan*) 213
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Templer* (*Maria Starnawska*) 215
- Jürgen Sarnowsky, *Die Johanniter. Ein geistlicher Ritterorden in Mittelalter und
Neuzeit* (*Krzysztof Kwiatkowski*) 217
- Magdalena Satora, *Sprawa templariuszy w dyplomacji zachodnioeuropejskiej 1307–
–1312* (*Piotr Oliński*) 221
- Tannenberg – Grunwald – Žalgiris 1410. Krieg und Frieden im späten Mittelalter*,
hrsg. v. Werner Paravicini, Rimvydas Petrauskas, Grischa Vercamer (*Krzysztof
Kwiatkowski*) 222

Magdalena Satora, *Sprawa templariuszy w dyplomacji zachodnioeuropejskiej 1307–1312* [*The Trial of Templars in Western European Diplomacy 1307–1312*], Wydawnictwo Poznańskie, Poznań 2011, 296 pp., ISBN 978-83-7177-788-2.

This book examines the mechanisms behind the operations of the medieval diplomacy of three European courts: the French, Aragonese and English. The common issue for them was the dissolution of the Order of the Knights Templar in the years 1307–1312. The book consists of four chapters. The first concerns Western European diplomacy at the beginning of the 14th century. Chapter II presents the circumstances leading up to the trial of the Knights Templar, and the events which led to their being imprisoned, sentenced and punished. The subsequent chapters are devoted to the diplomatic activity of the French, Aragonese and English courts. Each of these chapters is divided into two parts. The first concerns diplomatic policy conducted towards other European countries, while the second deals with policy towards the Papacy.

The basis for the analysis of the foreign policy of the Aragonese court consists of documents from the time of King James II (1291–1327) published by H. Finke in his book *Papsttum und Untergang der Templerordens*, complemented by some documents from the Archivo de la Corona de Aragón which were either omitted from that work or published in abbreviated versions. The author also uses documents published elsewhere concerning adjacent kingdoms, such as Castile. To describe English diplomatic activities the author uses basic publications from diplomatic sources, illustrating English contacts abroad, including the 18th-century edition of documents and writings by Thomas Rymer, the collections of the Public Record Office in London, and some unpublished writings concerning the Knights Templar from the British Library. For France, the author uses published collections of royal documents, but stresses that she had few documents concerning the issue of the Knights Templar at her disposal. The main she uses to describe the foreign policy of the Papacy are the seven-volume registers from the time of Pope Clement V. These are supplemented by the published biographies of popes, chronicles and papal letters.

The policy of Philip IV the Fair aimed at dissolving the Order of the Knights Templar, which became apparent after Jacques de Molay rejected the idea of a merger between the order and the Hospitallers. The aim of the French diplomats was to condemn the Knights Templar as soon as possible through an extensive propaganda campaign throughout Europe, as well as to win the support of Pope Clement V. These actions constitute one of the main themes of the whole work.

The author contradicts researchers who have advocated the assumption that Philip IV prevented the representatives of the Pope from taking control of the

property of the Knights Templar in France. In fact, Philip IV agreed to do so in Poitiers in 1308 and closely followed the established procedures. The resources obtained from the Templar properties were to be spent on crusades, and the Pope opted for the idea of passing the wealth of the Knights Templar on to the Knights Hospitaller. The monarchs of Aragon and England originally objected to the dissolution of the order, and their foreign policy was aimed at protecting it. However, they changed their minds when they realized that they could seize the wealth of the order themselves.

Apart from the meeting of the French king and his representatives with the Pope and his advisors in Poitiers in 1308, another key event which led to final decisions being made was the Council of Vienne in 1311. The council was also attended by the representatives of King James II of Aragon and King Edward II of England, whose priority was to solve the English-French conflict concerning the duchy of Guyenne, which they finally succeeded in accomplishing.

The author emphasizes the considerable independence of Pope Clement V in taking decisions. She also stresses that the pressure from Philip IV was much less significant than has been previously stated in literature on the subject. The Pope insisted on the dissolution of the order against the majority of the clergy, which was especially noticeable at the Council of Vienne. Philip IV cooperated with the Pope quite peacefully, his main motivation being to gain resources to finance another crusade. The policy of Edward II of England was driven by his particularistic interests in strengthening his rule within the complicated situation in his kingdom, and in relations with Scotland. Edward II objected to the Pope regarding the wealth of the Knights Templar, as did King James II of Aragon.

Piotr Oliński (Toruń)

Tannenberg – Grunwald – Žalgiris 1410. Krieg und Frieden im späten Mittelalter, hrsg. v. Werner Paravicini, Rimvydas Petrauskas, Grischa Vercamer (Deutsches Historisches Institut Warschau. *Quellen und Studien*, Bd. 26), Harrasowitz-Verlag, Wiesbaden 2012, 356 pp., 1 map, ISBN 978-3-447-06661-7.

Among numerous publications appearing in Central Europe in connection with the 600th anniversary of the battle of Tannenberg/Grunwald/Žalgiris (15 July 1410) the volume discussed here undoubtedly finds itself in the ranks of the most highly esteemed texts. It includes articles from outstanding experts on the subject of the Polish-Lithuanian and Teutonic war of 1409–1411 and on the 15th cen-